

1/28/2020

WASHINGTON ENERGY STRATEGY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Meeting 1 Summary

January 10, 2020, 1:00 to 4:00 PM

Sea-Tac Conference Center (Seattle-Tacoma Airport)

Meeting Participants

Advisory Committee Members

George Caan, Executive Director, Washington Public Utility Districts Association

Jason Campbell, Spokane Tribe and Chief Executive Officer, Sovereign Power

Co-Chair: Reeves Clippard, Chair, CleanTech Alliance and Chief Executive Officer, A&R Solar

Dave Danner, Chair, Washington Utilities and Transportation Commission

Beth Doglio, Representative, Washington State Legislature

Kathleen Drew, Chair, Energy Facility Site Evaluation Council

Will Einstein, Director of Product Development and Growth, Puget Sound Energy

Martin Gibbins, Water Issues Chair, League of Women Voters

Deric Gruen, Program Director, Front and Centered

Matt Harris, Director of Government Affairs and Assistant Executive Director, Washington State Potato Commission (participation via phone)

Co-Chair: Nancy Hirsh, Executive Director, NW Energy Coalition

Nicole Hughes, Executive Director, Renewable Northwest

Paul Jewell, Policy Director, Washington State Association of Counties

Dan Kirschner, Executive Director, Northwest Gas Association

Kent Lopez, General Manager, Washington Rural Electric Cooperative Association

Bruce Martin, Energy Resource Manager, WestRock Tacoma

Patrick Oshie, Member, Northwest Power and Conservation Council

Clay Norris, Power Management Manager, Tacoma Power

Rebecca Ponzio, Climate & Fossil Fuel Program Director, Washington Environmental Council

Chris Roe, Senior Manager, Amazon

John Rothlin, Manager of Washington Government Relations, Avista Corporation

Tim Sheldon, Senator, Washington State Legislature

Jessica Spiegel, Director Northwest Region, Western States Petroleum Association

Dan Wilson, President, Local 338 United Steelworkers

Alex Ybarra, Representative, Washington State Legislature

State Senator Reuven Carlyle was unable to participate in this meeting.

Other Meeting Participants

Angela Becker-Dippmann, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory

Tom Beierle, Ross Strategic (facilitation support)

Glenn Blackmon, Washington State Department of Commerce

1/28/2020

Lisa Brown, Director, Washington State Department of Commerce
Andy Chinn, Ross Strategic (facilitation support)
Chris Davis, Office of Governor Jay Inslee
Michael Furze, Washington State Department of Commerce
Kate Kelly, Washington State Department of Commerce
Heather Martin, Ross Strategic (facilitation support)
Lauren McCloy, Office of Governor Jay Inslee

Welcome and Introductory Remarks

Washington State Energy Strategy Advisory Committee Co-Chair Reeves Clippard welcomed meeting participants. Mr. Clippard urged Committee members to think about how to unleash the creative thinking in the room to address climate and energy needs over the next thirty years in Washington State.

Department of Commerce Director Lisa Brown welcomed meeting participants. Director Brown began by respectfully acknowledging that the meeting was being held on [the territory of the Muckleshoot peoples and its descendants](#). These lands were home to the Salish people for tens of thousands of years and Director Brown thanked them for their continued stewardship and the critical role they play to restore and protect important cultural and natural resources. Director Brown then discussed the challenge of decoupling economic growth from greenhouse gas emissions, which also represents an opportunity to demonstrate the success of critical investments in the electricity grid, transportation network, buildings, and other areas. Director Brown emphasized that this is not an Eastern Washington or Western Washington issue, nor is it a rural versus urban issue. She noted that the Committee's challenge is to meet the three objectives laid out in the legislation ([RCW 43.21F.010](#)):

- Maintain energy prices that are fair and reasonable
- Foster a clean energy economy and jobs
- Meet state obligations to reduce GHG emissions

Lauren McCloy, Senior Energy Policy Advisor to Governor Inslee welcomed meeting participants and set the context for the Advisory Committee's work. This included the latest climate change science, estimated impacts, and recommendations from the most recent Department of Ecology report. Ms. McCloy noted that the Advisory Committee will hear from subject matter experts over the course of its work and will provide input to the Department of Commerce as the agency develops the State Energy Strategy throughout 2020.

Advisory Committee Member Introductions and Remarks

Advisory Committee members introduced themselves and provided brief remarks regarding their participation. Advisory Committee member comments included the following:

- Hopeful that this Committee can think about future generations and the need for a planet as habitable as that experienced by previous generations.
- Understanding that some communities will be hit harder than others by climate change, it is important to ensure that policies are just and equitable.
- Affordability, adequacy, and grid reliability are key considerations for any contemplated change to energy production, transmission, or distribution in the state.
- It is not necessary to choose between the environment and the economy.
- The State Energy Strategy should meet utility customers' needs.

- Energy and climate policies should equitably invest in Washington's clean energy economy.
- Implementation details of the State Energy Strategy will have far-reaching and long-lasting impacts on large scale energy users.
- The State Energy Strategy should have the flexibility to accommodate rural electric cooperatives.
- Energy policies should be environmentally balanced while considering market mechanisms.
- It is important to include tribal perspectives in the conversation.
- Existing installed energy infrastructure is an important element to consider in the conversation.
- There are several existing laws/mandates related to decoupling economic growth from energy use; it is important to look at lessons learned around what has already been implemented and then consider what additional actions need to be taken.
- New technologies are beginning to be deployed while others such as solar and wind have been operating for decades; there is a high amount of innovation occurring in the energy sector. We need to ensure equity by remembering that the growth and abundance mindset should cover all corners of society.
- Growing, processing, and shipping agricultural products requires significant amounts of energy; combined with its economic contributions, the agricultural sector has an interest in the outcome of the Committee's work.

Advisory Committee Charge and Charter

Tom Beierle, lead facilitator from Ross Strategic, reviewed highlights from the Advisory Committee charge and charter. Mr. Beierle emphasized that the group is providing guidance and recommendations to the Department of Commerce as Commerce develops the State Energy Strategy. The Advisory Committee's work will be guided by goals and principles, laid out in Washington law. The Advisory Committee work is anticipated to be informed by technical workgroups which are expected to provide a deeper look at specific topics. The charge and charter emphasize that the Advisory Committee is focused on how the state can meet its clean energy goals. The Advisory Committee is not expected to revisit state energy goals, existing energy policy, climate science, or greenhouse gas reduction goals. The Advisory Committee is not seeking consensus or voting, but rather is seeking areas of convergence among members on options for the State Energy Strategy.

The presentation is available [here](#).

The Advisory Committee process will unfold over four phases, with up to nine meetings throughout 2020. The proposed phases are:

1. Kickoff meeting and context setting
2. Technical analysis (following the 2020 legislative session)
3. Reviewing the technical analysis and discussing cross-cutting issues
4. Review and feedback on the proposed State Energy Strategy

Advisory Committee members provided feedback on the draft Advisory Committee charter:

- Include a reference to the contribution of nuclear power as a non-emitting energy source. A later comment from an Advisory Committee member clarified that multiple sectors contribute to greenhouse gas emissions, not just the energy sector and suggested removing references to any specific source of electric power.
- Remove citations to specific energy sector studies, as there are numerous studies that potentially complement the Advisory Committee's work.

- Clarify that both short-term and long-term investments may be appropriate to consider in the state energy strategy development.
- Align the language in the charter to match the enabling language regarding job creation and costs.

State Energy Strategy Context

Michael Furze, Assistant Director, Energy Division, Department of Commerce provided additional context on the work of the Advisory Committee. Commerce is developing the updated State Energy Strategy with the goal of identifying possible actions to achieve Washington's greenhouse gas reduction targets. Commerce will contract with technical consultants to help with this part of the project. The updated State Energy Strategy will also consider potential effects on energy pricing and workforce development. For the sectors under consideration, the State Energy Strategy will address how deep decarbonization can occur across sectors. Finally, cross-cutting issues such as equity, rural/urban issues and economic development will be considered during the State Energy Strategy development process.

Advisory Committee Comments and Questions (and responses):

- What is the relation between Clean Energy Transformation Act (CETA) compliance efforts and the Advisory Committee work?
 - *The Advisory Committee charge involves thinking more broadly about moving away from fossil fuels.*
- What does it mean for the Advisory Committee to provide a venue for broader public involvement?
 - *The Advisory Committee is one point of connectivity during the State Energy Strategy development process. This will include moving Advisory Committee meetings in different areas of the state, and one dedicated public hearing.*
- Will the technical analysis involve review of existing work or is there an opportunity for Committee members to recommend topics or studies?
 - *The work is broadly defined and will include opportunities for the Advisory Committee to provide input and ideas. Commerce currently has a request for proposals out to secure technical support.*
- Are the technical subgroups composed of Committee members, others, or both?
 - *Technical committees may be established by Commerce and will likely include experts who are not on the Advisory Committee. There have been several requests to Commerce to provide expertise to the workgroups. At the March Advisory Committee meeting we will discuss the workgroups' composition and structure. Kate Kelly is the point of contact for those inquiries.*
- Is the Advisory Committee expected to consider pressures on energy consumption external to Washington State?
 - *That is up to the Advisory Committee, but seems like an important consideration.*
- Who will use the State Energy Strategy?
 - *This is the 3rd version of the State Energy Strategy and based on web data Commerce is aware that users download the document. For the updated version on which the Advisory Committee is providing input, the focus is on implementation. Commerce is looking to the Advisory Committee to help make connections with users who will put the State Energy Strategy into practice.*

Introduction to Washington's Energy System

Angela Becker-Dippmann, Strategy Advisor, Energy & Environment Directorate, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL) provided a presentation on Washington State's energy system. Ms. Becker-Dippmann discussed the state's energy resource mix and relative contribution of greenhouse gas emissions by sector. Ms. Becker-Dippmann then outlined anticipated concepts and technologies that will affect the state's energy system, such as building-grid integration, grid-scale storage, transportation electrification, power to liquids, and decarbonization of the maritime and aviation sectors. Ms. Becker-Dippmann discussed climate change, wildfires, and availability of hydro power before presenting several key takeaways.

Ms. Becker-Dippmann's presentation is available [here](#).

Advisory Committee Comments and Questions (and responses):

- Is PNNL considering battery storage for grid-scale flexible loading?
 - *PNNL is working to understand the relative economics of fuel cells compared to batteries, both for the energy grid and for high density transportation needs.*
- Has PNNL researched methane emissions associated with natural gas infrastructure?
 - *Argonne and Sandia National Laboratories have done most of the research around this topic.*
- Has PNNL looked beyond 2025 to estimate whether there are sufficient resources to support vehicle electrification?
 - *That research has not been done but it is an interesting question, especially if buildings are included.*
- How does distributed renewable energy and aggregation of those sources factor into future energy systems?
 - *PNNL has looked into coordination of distributed systems and what is required to aggregate them (communications networks, control networks, etc.). California is working on the same issues.*

Public Comments

Members of the public were provided an opportunity to address meeting participants. Comments are summarized below:

- If the Energy Strategy is to transform us from an economy based on fossil fuels to an economy based on carbon-free energy, while still being reliable, we will need substantial new technologies for storing clean electricity, including battery storage.
- For the updated Energy Strategy, the Committee should consider the role of renewable hydrogen, including as a transportation fuel and possible storage in gas pipelines as a source of fuel for electricity generation.

Next Steps and Action Items

- Ross Strategic will revise the draft Advisory Committee charter, which will be discussed and affirmed at the next meeting.
- Ross Strategic and the Department of Commerce will work with committee members to set the dates and locations for upcoming Advisory Committee meetings.